

भारत के नियंत्रक-महालेखापरीक्षक का कार्यालय
9, दीन दयाल उपाध्याय मार्ग,
नई दिल्ली-110 124



OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER &
AUDITOR GENERAL OF INDIA
9, DEENDAYAL UPADHYAYA MARG,
NEW DELHI - 110 124

दिनांक / DATE 12.09.2011

To,
Shri Venkatesh Nayak,
B-117, Second Floor,
Sarvodaya Enclave,
New Delhi-110 017.

Sub: Your application under RTI Act.

Sir,

I am to refer to your application dated 04.08.2011, received under RTI Act on 09.08.2011 and to furnish following information:

(i) No PPP Project has been audited in Puducherry and Uttar Pradesh. Position in five other States (Delhi, Karnataka, Tamilnadu, Rajasthan and West Bengal) is given in **Annexure I**.

(ii) The information sought with regards to PPP projects audited by the Special Category States during the aforesaid period from 01.04.2008 to 01.08.2011 is given in **Annexure-II**.

(iii) In Bihar and Goa, no Public Private Partnership (PPP) project has been audited. In respect of the remaining four States (Jharkhand, Kerala, Haryana and Maharashtra) , lists of names, geographical locations and the implementation status of PPP projects audited is given in the enclosed **Annexure III**. There is no exclusive Audit Report on PPP projects in respect of any of the States. Therefore, the availability of it in the public domain, free of cost or as a priced publication, does not arise. The Sr. Deputy Accountant General (Admn.) /Deputy Accountant General (Admn.) in each Audit offices mentioned above is the Central Public Information Officer and is the competent authority to give information under the RTI Act, 2005 of all the States mentioned.

(iv) For Central Civil Projects, the information is given in **Annexure-IV**.

(v) So far as P&T Department is concerned, the report is NIL.

2. The appellate Authority is Shri Jayanti Prasad, Pr Director of Audit (Headquarters) and appeal can be filed within 30 days in terms of Section 19 (1) of RTI Act.

Yours faithfully,


(R SRINIVASAN)

Pr Legal Advisor & CPIO

Encl: As above.

Annexure I

Sl.	Name of States	Name(s) of PPP projects audited with location	Implementation status	Names of reviews/Paragraphs on PPP projects appeared in the Audit Report	No. of para in Audit Report with year	Whether the Report has been placed in the State Legislature
(a)	(b)	(c)	(d)	(e)	(f)	(g)
1.	Delhi	Three projects (details in Annexure)	One completed	Nil	Nil	Not applicable (NA)
2.	Karnataka	Comprehensive computerisation of Food Civil Supplies & Consumer Affairs Department in Karnataka	Implementation in progress	Project at col. (a) –Being proposed for Audit Report 2010-11	Nil	NA
3	Tamil Nadu	100 mld capacity sea water desalination project at Kattupalli, Minjur (TN)	Commissioned in June 2010	Project at col. (a) –Being proposed for Audit Report 2010-11	Nil	NA
4	Rajasthan	Emergency Response Service – Ambulance 108 Service in Rajasthan	Project dropped	Project at col. (a) – Factual statement sent to Government	Nil	NA
5	West Bengal (Audit)	Six (details annexed)	Three completed , three incomplete	One (Sl.1) on installation of CT Scan machine at SSKM Hosp. Kolkata	Para No. 3.1.3 of Audit Report (Civil) 2008-09	Yes
	West Bengal (Works)	Nine (details annexed)	Six projects completed and three are ongoing	1 Sealdah area development including construction of Court-cum-commercial Complex. 2. Multi-level car parking systems at Rowdon Street and Lindsey Street.	1. Para 3.2.1 of Audit Report (Civil) 2008-09 2. Para 3.4.1 of Audit Report (Civil) 2008-09	Yes

Further, the Audit Reports, containing audit findings on PPP Projects, which have been placed in the State Legislatures are available in the website of the CAG. The printed copies of the Audit Reports (Civil) will be available with the concerned Audit offices in the above States. The details of the audit findings not included in the Audit Report are not available with this office. These are available with the concerned PAG/AG (Audit). The status of implementation given above is as on the date of audit. The current status will be available with the concerned Organization/State Government.

SLNo	Name of the Project	Geographical location	Implementation status
PAG (Audit) West Bengal			
1	1. Installation of Spiral CT Scan Machine	SSKM Hospital, Kolkata	Installed/ functioning
2	Installation of mechanized laundry units.	SSKM Hospital, Kolkata	Installed/ functioning
3	Installation of Spiral CT Scan Machine	R.G. Kar Medical College, Kolkata	Installed in June 2003.
4	Construction of residential cum commercial complex and beautification	Burdwan court compound	As of Nov'2010 the project remained incomplete
5	Construction and development of a Bus cum Truck Terminus cum Commercial Complex.	Near Burdwan	As of Nov'2010 the project was not completed, though due by March 2009
6	Construction and development of a Bus cum Truck Terminus cum Commercial Complex by Burdwan Development Authority (BDA)	Mouza Nababhat under Burdwan PS	Construction of the Project completed. Premium of Rs.66.80 lakh, due from private partner to BDA, remained unrealized as of Dec'2010
AG (RW&LBA) West Bengal			
1.	Sealdah area development including construction of Court cum commercial complex within the existing Court Campus	Sealdah, Kolkata	Completed
2.	Multi-level car parking systems at Rowdon Street and Lindsey Street including shopping mall at Lindsey Street.	Lindsay Street, Kolkata	Completed
3.	Water Supply & Sewerage System at Sector V, Salt Lake, Kolkata	Salt Lake, North 24 Parganas	Completed
4.	Kolkata Logistics Hub at Kona	Kona, Dist Howrah	Ongoing
5.	Residential/commercial complex on KMDA land at Manicktala	Manicktala, Kolkata	Ongoing
6.	IT Logistics Centre at Sector- V, Salt Lake	Salt Lake, North 24 Parganas	Ongoing
7.	Stadium Based Commercial Complex	Rajdanga, Kolkata	Completed
8.	City Centre	Salt Lake, Kolkata	Completed
9.	Hiland Park	Baghajatin, Kolkata	Completed
AG (Audit) Delhi			
1	Delhi Transport Corporation.-Construction of 248 modern stainless steel Bus Queue Shelters under BOT-1 scheme	Throughout Delhi.	Construction completed
2	2. Delhi Tourism and Transportation Development Corporation- Installation and maintenance of street furniture on PWD Road	In the vicinity of Commonwealth Games venues	Not completed up to the date of audit (January 2011), expected completion 31 st March, 2011.
3	3. IT Deptt. of Delhi -(a) 'e-governance-Jeevan (b).Aap Ki Sunwai. (c) e-procurement	Delhi	Implemented

Annexure-II

a)	The list of names, geographical location and the implementation status of Private Public Partnership (PPP) projects audited under the authority of the C&AG during the period 1 st April, 2008 to 1 st August, 2011.	<p>1.Hydro-Power Projects (Implementation through Private Sector Participation)</p> <p>Location: Uttarakhand</p> <p>Status of Projects: Please refer Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India for the Year ended 31 March 2009, Government of Uttarakhand - "Performance Audit of Hydro-Power Development through Private Sector Participation"</p> <p>(Standalone State Report 2008-09- Available in Public domain at Website: www.cag.gov.in)</p>	<p>2.Development of Hydro power Projects- Public Private Participation</p> <p>Location: Sikkim</p> <p>Status of Projects: Please refer Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India for the Year ended 31 March 2009, Government of Sikkim (Featured as Para 1.1 under Chapter-I: Performance Reviews of the Report).</p> <p>(State Audit Report 2008-09- Available in Public domain at Website: www.cag.gov.in)</p>
b)	Please indicate whether copies of the audit reports for all the PPP projects mentioned above are available in the public domain free of cost or as priced publications.	This Standalone Performance Audit Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India for the Year ended 31 March 2009, Government of Uttarakhand mentioned above is a priced publication. However, this report is available in the public domain at Website: www.cag.gov.in free of cost.	This Audit Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India for the Year ended 31 March 2009, Government of Sikkim mentioned above is a priced publication. However, this report is available in the public domain at Website: www.cag.gov.in free of cost.
c)	Please indicate the authority responsible for providing to any member of the public copies of audit reports of PPP Projects.	<p>The cost of the printed copy of the Report is Rs 65.00 Printed copy of the Report can be obtained from:</p> <p>Principal Accountant General (Audit) Uttarakhand, Vaibhav Palace, C-1/105, Indira Nagar, Dehradun – 248 006</p>	<p>The cost of the printed copy of the Report is Rs 65.00 Printed copy of the Report can be obtained from:</p> <p>Accountant General (Audit) Sikkim, Lekha Pariksha Bhavan, Deorali Gangtok-737 102</p>
d)	Please indicate whether audit reports of the PPP projects under Central Government are placed before any parliamentary committee for scrutiny, if so the name of such committee and a brief description of all the stages involved in the scrutiny process may please be provided.	<p>Not applicable for Report States-II Wing.</p> <p>However, since the report pertains to Uttarakhand, it has been placed in the State Legislature.</p>	<p>Not applicable for Report States-II Wing.</p> <p>However, since the report pertains to Sikkim, it has been placed in the State Legislature.</p>

Annexure III

Sl. No	Name of the State	Name(s) of PPP projects audited with location	Implementation status	Name of reviews/Paragraphs on PPP projects appeared in the Audit Report	No. of Para in Audit Report with year	Whether the Report has been placed in the State Legislature
1.	Jharkhand	(i) DORTH for Four laning of Hazaribagh & Ranchi Section of NH-33 (Km 40 to 114)	Km 76 to 97 completed	Nil	N/A	N/A
		(ii) Upgradation of existing two lane of Ranchi-Rargaon, Jamshedpur Section of NH-33	Km 186 to 197 & Km 209 to 211 completed	Nil	N/A	N/A
2.	Kerala	(i) Thiruvananthapuram City Roads Improvement Project implemented by Kerala Road Fund Board at Thiruvananthapuram	Work in progress	Nil	N/A	N/A
		(ii) Development of ICICI-Kinfra Ltd. at Thiruvananthapuram.	Project ongoing	Nil	N/A	N/A
		(iii) Marine Products Infrastructure Development Corporation Ltd. at Ernakulam.	Project ongoing			
3.	Haryana	(i) Kundli Manesar Palwal (KMP) Expressway at Haryana.	Project under progress.	Nil	N/A	N/A
		(ii) Gurgaon Recreation Park, Gurgaon at Haryana.	Project under progress.	Nil	N/A	N/A
		(iii) Mahatama Gandhi Super Thermal Power Project, Jhajjar at Haryana.	Project under progress	Nil	N/A	N/A
4.	Maharashtra	(i) Development of plot of land owned by the Regional Transport Officer at Andheri, Mumbai	Project under progress	Loss to the Government and undue benefit to a developer	Para 3.3.3 of Audit Report (Civil)-2008-09	Yes
		(ii) Development of Government property in Mumbai at Fort and Andheri areas	Project under progress	Undue benefit to the private developer	Para 3.3.3 of Audit Report (Civil)-2008-09	Yes

Annexure-IV

Query	Information furnished
The list of names, geographical location and the implementation status of private Public Partnership (PPP) projects audited under the authority of the C&AG during the period 1st April 2008-1st August 2011	We do not maintain information sector-wise, however, an audit of the Production Sharing Contracts entered into by the Government with several private operators for Hydrocarbon Exploration and Production has been carried out the results of the Audit has been published in Audit Report No. 19 of 2011-12. Though Hydrocarbon Sharing Contracts are not categorized technically as PPPs, they share many of the characteristics of the PPPs.
Please indicate whether copies of the audit reports for all the PPP Projects mentioned above are available in the public domain free of cost or as priced publications;	All the Audit Reports tabled on both the Houses of the Parliament are hosted on the CAG's website www.saiindia.gov.in . Hard copies can be obtained from our offices. These are not priced.
Please indicate the authority responsible for providing to any member of the public copies of audit reports of PPP projects;	While the electronic version can be accessed through the website, hard copies can be obtained from our offices.
Please indicate whether audit reports of PPPs under Central Government are placed before any parliamentary committee for scrutiny, if so the name of such committee and a brief description of all the stages involved in the scrutiny process may be please provided.	Audit Reports under Article 151 of the Constitution of India covering all audits are submitted to the President of India for Tabling of the Reports in the Parliament. These Audit Reports are automatically referred to the Public Accounts Committee of the Parliament, who examine, in detail, the issues brought out in the Audit Reports. Oral evidence of the concerned Ministry /Departments officials is taken by the Committee. Based on the Examination and the evidence submitted by the Ministry /Department, the Committee prepares a Report, which included the Committee's recommendations, for submission to the Parliament. Actions taken by the Ministry /Department on the recommendations of the Committee are watched by the Committee, who may once again call the Ministry for further examination. A final Action Taken Statement is submitted to the Parliament by the Committee.